To: Matt Luxon [MattL@windwardenv.com]

Cc: James McKenna [jim.mckenna@verdantllc.com]; ennifer Woronets [jworonets@anchorqea.com]; ohn Toll [JohnT@windwardenv.com]; N=Chip

Humphrey/OU=R10/O=USEPA/C=US@EPA[]

Bcc:

From: CN=Burt Shephard/OU=R10/O=USEPA/C=US

Sent: Thur 1/31/2013 5:39:35 PM

Subject: Re: Comment 85

day1a[1].pdf
1268_Henny[1].pdf
Columbia_River_Food_Chain_Study[1].pdf
Henny et al 2009 BAFs for osprey in Willamette.pdf
www.windwardenv.com

Matt,

Attached is a presentation EPA made several years ago that summarizes much of the contaminant in bird egg data. Slide 27 shows the relative concentration of PCBs in osprey and eagle eggs from the lower Columbia basin. It supports the comment, although to my eyes its closer to a 3x difference, with eagle eggs being higher in PCBs.

The raw data comes from several reports published by U.S. Fish and Wildlife Service, you can look for studies coauthored by either Chuck Henny or Jeremy Buck. A couple of them are also attached.

Best regards,

Burt Shephard Risk Evaluation Unit Office of Environmental Assessment (OEA-095) U.S. Environmental Protection Agency, Region 10 1200 6th Avenue Seattle, WA 98101

Telephone: (206) 553-6359 Fax: (206) 553-0119

e-mail: Shephard.Burt@epa.gov

"Facts are stubborn things"
- John Adams

From: Matt Luxon <MattL@windwardenv.com>
To: Burt Shephard/R10/USEPA/US@EPA,

Cc: James McKenna < jim.mckenna@verdantllc.com >, Jennifer Woronets

<jworonets@anchorgea.com>, John Toll <JohnT@windwardenv.com>

Date: 01/29/2013 02:14 PM

Subject: Comment 85

Hi Burt.

I can't find any reports supporting the below statement from EPA comment 85. Would you please provide the citation to us ASAP.

The BERA assumes the site specific osprey eggs would be equivalent to eagle eggs, and ignores the higher trophic level of the bald eagles, and that contaminants in the lower Columbia River eagles eggs tend to around 2 times higher than osprey.

Thanks, Matt

Matt Luxon Associate Windward Environmental LLC 2629 Iron St. Bellingham, WA 98225 (360) 543-7882 (360) 296-6712 (cell) www.windwardenv.com

The information contained in this e-mail message is intended only for the personal and confidential use of the recipient named above. This message may be an attorney-client communication and as such is privileged and confidential. If the reader of this message is not the recipient named above or an agent responsible for delivering it to the intended recipient, the reader is hereby notified that this message has been received in error and that any review, dissemination, copying or distribution of this message is strictly prohibited. If you have received this message in error, please notify the sender immediately, and delete this message.